
Sofia Hayati Yusoff  
Fakulti Bahasa Moden dan Komunikasi,  
Universiti Putra Malaysia,  
Malaysia.  
*adiknuha@yahoo.com*

Md. Salleh Hj Hassan, Ph.D  
Fakulti Bahasa Moden dan Komunikasi,  
Universiti Putra Malaysia,  
Malaysia.  
*md.salleh@upm.edu.my*

Mohd Nizam Osman, Ph.D  
Fakulti Bahasa Moden dan Komunikasi,  
Universiti Putra Malaysia,  
Malaysia.  
*mo_nizam@upm.edu.my*

Ezhar Tamam, Ph.D  
Fakulti Bahasa Moden dan Komunikasi,  
Universiti Putra Malaysia,  
Malaysia.  
*ezhar@upm.edu.my*

**Abstract**

Numerous researches have proven that Muslims have been negatively portrayed by the western media for many terrorist attacks or alleged ‘terror plots’ following the 9/11 incident. The media
made a deliberate and concerted effort to associate Islam and Muslims with terrorism. As the world mourns the mark of the tenth year of the fateful event, we witness significant events including the electoral presidency of Barrack Obama, the Arabs spring movement and the death of Osama Bin Laden. The events have urged the researchers to uncover the patterns of the framings on Islam and its association with terrorism by the two most influential international news magazines; TIME and The Economist. Using the content analysis approach, the researchers have chosen articles that place a special focus on Muslims or Islam, either directly or indirectly. The rationale for conducting quantitative content analysis is to obtain the labeling tendency and to search for any significant differences in labeling patterns between the four periods selected; one month before Sept 11, one month right after Sept 11, one month after 5 years and finally for one month 10 years after the incident. The sampling procedure for related articles in these two news magazines was based on constructive week basis. Finally, the researchers have made conclusions on the framing patterns; Is Islam still associated with terrorism after 10 years of 9/11 like it was during the most crucial period right after the incident?

**Keyword:** Media labeling, Media framing, Islam and terrorism, Islam and media

**Introduction**

The role of media is to shape opinions and present particular versions as reality. They work to disseminate information and create public opinion. Media are also believed and expected to portray a fair picture on any issues which occur both at local and international level. However, in portraying Islam especially after the September 11 attacks, a number of research found that international media tend to negatively depict Islam by associating it with terrorism (Zulkifli, 2009; Winegar, 2008; Gerges, 2003). Issues concerning the way international media, specifically in the US and UK, equate Islam with terrorism have been tremendously debated. Research showed that after the September 11 attack, terrorism has been repeatedly associated with Islam by most of the international media. The definition of terrorism at the moment is too narrow because it only depicts Islam and Muslims in an irrelevant manner (Mahathir, 2003).
The attacks on World Trade Center in New York and Pentagon on September, 11th 2001 have given a massive impact to the whole world. The impact on the United States was much bigger in various aspects including economics and military as well as the US credibility as the most powerful nation in the world. This has led the US to take revengeful actions against those who were accused to be responsible for the attack, thus making this an opportunity for the US to do anything on anyone they dislike despite of protests made by international society against the US (The Star, Jan 19th, 2002:15). The US has made an initiative hunting and targeting any parties involved in the so called terrorism act. The first step taken besides arresting few targeted individuals was to attack Afghanistan in which the ruler was claimed to have an affiliation with terrorists who were responsible for the September 11 attacks.

In relation to this, the issue of fighting against terrorism has been the most important agenda prioritized by international media. The mass media in the US and its counterpart, UK such as Cable News Network (CNN), British Broadcasting Corporation (BBC), some mainstream news magazines namely Newsweek and TIME as well as other media have played a significant role in influencing the whole world to morally support the US in protesting against terrorism (Hashim, 2009). Obviously, western countries are prone to identify terrorism with certain groups that are labeled as extremists, militants or Muslim extremists (Zulkifli, 2009). Such an effort today is seen to focus on Muslim groups which are coincidentally accused to be responsible for the September 11 attacks, and this badly affects the whole Muslim society worldwide. This happened due to an accusation made by the US government on Islam through most of the western media for the tragedy at the World Trade Center (Winegar, 2008).
A number of research have been conducted in examining the case of the western media framing Islam and they have proven that there is a framing tendency that exists in labeling Islam with terrorism (as in Dina, 2010; Malcolm et al, 2010; Noor Mayudia et al, 2010; Hashim, 2009; Mishra, 2008) yet none have looked into the comparison of framing at different periods of time. This has urged the researchers to study the framing patterns made by TIME and The Economist on Islam and Muslims and their association with terrorism across time.

The idea to study this issue started when the researcher felt that the issue of Islam and Muslims has caught the attention of the public around the world and it is very much related to the Muslims’ sensitivity. The observation made by the researcher found that the western media tend to be biased against Muslims in their coverage. Only issues that show Muslims as negative images are likely to be focused on, and yet a very small number of stories on positive images of Muslims are portrayed in the western media.

An overwhelming influx of news on terrorism that are mostly connected to Islam and Muslims have created a lot of arguments and misunderstandings which have created a gap between religions. Besides, there is an extension of negative stereotype, discrimination and hatred towards Muslims, especially by the Western media (Mahathir, 2003; Jafri, 1998). A number of case studies conducted on western media coverage of the Middle East and Islam are often examined with socio psychological concepts like “stereotypes” or “images” (Hashem, 1995; Hippler & Lueg, 1995). The example of the drive for such negative coverage made by western media is to characterize Muslims as backward and violent fanatics (Hafez, 2000). Such media coverage has led to negative consequences especially for Muslims who live as minority in
western countries. Due to negative media coverage following a number of terror incidents, Muslims have been ill treated by western society. Apparently, their image has been tarnished causing difficulty in acceptance at most public premises such as schools, offices, and even shopping malls. There were cases where Muslims were called ‘dog’ or ‘devil’ by the public who have been fully fed with negative stories by the media (Sofia et al., 2013).

The negative coverage on Islam and Muslims has appeared in western media before the September 11 attacks, yet the turning point of such discrimination occurred remarkably after September 11 (Hashim, 2009). Pointing Muslims as terrorist and Islam as the religion of terrorism made by western media especially those in the US and the UK have existed far before the September 11. Many research have been conducted in proving this statement to be true (Mahathir, 2003; Ibrahim, 2011; Tahir, 2011). For instance, the conflict between Israelis and Palestinians has been regarded as related to the issue of terrorism. In this conflict, western media have always put the blame on Palestinians and Islam has always been addressed as violent and aggressive (Hashim, 2009; Cole, 2009). However/Moreover, the accusation and negative portrayal made by the media have increased dramatically following the September 11 attack. News reports, featured articles and photos on Islam or Muslims are found to have received wide coverage and presented by western media or international news agencies after the incident of September 11 (Sofia et al., 2013; Fauziah, 2011; Hashim, 2009; Dina, 2005).

The issue of Islam and terrorism is a never ending story. The bad image received by the Muslims following the September 11 attack has continued in a few/some major incidents especially within five to ten years after the September 11 attacks. The media coverage in the US and the UK has
led to the association of Muslims with terrorism. Esposito & Ibrahim (2011) reported that one having negative perceptions or prejudices against Muslims is in favour of using specific security measures with Muslims as a way to prevent terrorism. Such association continued after 2006 following a series of attacks such as the London and Bali bombings which occurred in 2005 as well as negative media coverage along the period. In 2010, another survey made by a Gallup centre for Muslim Studies revealed that about 4 to 5 of 10 Americans (45 percent) admitted to having at least “a little” prejudice towards Muslims. While 10 percent had a feeling of “a great deal” of prejudice towards Muslims and 20 percent admitted to have feeling of “some” prejudice and such feelings were very much admitted by the respondents as a consequence of negative media coverage on Muslims and their religion.

**Media Agenda on Islam and Terrorism**

There are several views on the role of media in relation to terrorism. Media sometimes are known as the main agent in transmitting messages to society on the danger of terrorism. According to Mc Quail (1995), in certain conditions, media can help the government deal with terror issues by giving a negative label or name to terrorist groups and generating some panic situations to terrorists through the information spread. Lowenthal (1989) claimed that without the collaboration of the media, terrorism would be impotent. By dramatizing the terrorist’s threats and demands and by refusing to condemn them outright, the media often contribute to the moral confusion which tends to romanticize the terrorist and leave his victims forgotten.

Mc Quail (1995) also argued that despite all contributions made by media in creating awareness of the danger of terrorism which then leads to having a sense of hatred among society, media are
said to be able to give publicity as well as legitimacy to certain terrorist political agenda due to
some failures made by the government. Researchers on terrorism believe that one of the reasons
of any terror acts or sabotage done by terrorists is for publicity or to attract society’s attention
(Cole, 2009). Simonsen and Spindlove (2000) pointed out that, media give negative effect in
handling terrorism even though a government does some filtrations in selecting information for
neutralization purpose.

Media labeling is not something segregated from the agenda of certain countries or an opposing
ideology. Peter Drucker (1996), a famous scholar in the US management in his famous book that
talks about “post-modern” world, once stressed out that the next threats after the downfall of the
Soviet on the development of capitalism are the attacks made by suicide bombers which is
somehow directed towards Islam, because there are many Muslim activities especially from
targeted groups that apply suicide bombing method as a revenge against discrimination made by
the West over Muslims. This somehow leads to the negative labeling on Islam and Muslim by
the media especially the ones from the West.

Beliaev & Marks (1991) claimed that the relationship between religion and violence labeled in
the media is, in fact, not new. Some media label religion and terrorism with holy wars and
inquisitions. The words “assassin”, “zealot” and “thug” are used to project some fanatic groups
within respectively Islam, Judaism and Hinduism respectively. Later, the label was further used
to some so called Muslim terrorists as Muslim fanatics who were involved in a series of
bombings and assassinations, particularly in the Middle East during the 80s.
After the September 11 incident, terrorist labeling has been identified by the media as Muslim fundamentalists or ‘Islamists’ which has increased some prejudices, discriminations against and attacks on Muslims or Middle East. In fact, some labels given are extremely outrageous such as ‘uncivilized’ and ‘barbaric’ (Orbe & Harris, 2008). Therefore, labeling and associating terrorism with Islam is not something new. Based on a number of literatures which relate to media and terrorism, the main labels that focused on Islam which had been long utilised by either a country or its media are as follow:

1) Muslim leaders and public figures such as Muammar Gaddafi, Yasser Arafat and Ayatullah Khomeini are violently bad. Khomeini had been once labeled as cruel as Adolf Hitler (Hashim, 2009).

2) Islamic movements such as Hamas in Palestine, Hezbollah in Lebanon and Ikhwan-Al-Muslimin in Egypt are regarded as militants and associated with violence especially when elements of ‘jihad’ (translated by media as holy war) is practiced in these movements.

3) Muslim countries with advanced weapon development are always considered as threats by the western media. These media always portray that something bad will happen if such a development is allowed to happen. For instance, the uranium project by Iran has been reported in most of international media as a military strategy of Iran against the US.

4) The main profiles that are labeled as terrorists have always been among Muslims. Currently, Osama bin Laden and the Iranian President Ahmadinejad are claimed to be militants who can create chaos (Mishra, 2008).
5) The existence of political movements in countries like Afghanistan, Chechnya, Palestine and Iraq which are militant in nature has caused all Muslims worldwide to be also labeled by western media as terrorists.

6) The term ‘fundamentalism’, which originally exists in all religions such as Judaism, Christianity or Islam, now belongs to Islam especially to Muslims who intend to hold the absolute teachings of Islam and reject the idea of secularism. Consequently, few other related terms that are militant and radical in nature have been addressed to Muslims like ‘Islamic fundamentalist’ and ‘Islamic radicals’ (www.wikipedia.org/militant_islam).

7) The struggle for independence such as in Palestine is portrayed as terrorist movement. One of the examples is when CNN displays Islam as connected with terrorism in its program entitled ‘Trauma or Terror’ that shows the bitterness faced by Israelis due to the struck made by Palestinians (Farook, 2006).

8) International media also shows Islam as the next threat after the downfall of the Soviet Union. One of the Muslim journalists wrote:

   Now that the Soviet Union, which former President Ronald Reagan described as an ‘evil empire’, is no more, they picked on the Muslims and initially started a sinister media campaign projecting Muslims as violent people before openly branding them as terrorists and subsequently, the West triggered off military conflicts in different parts of Muslim world.

   (Farook, 2006).

9) Apart from the organizations or political movements which are labeled as terrorists, there are also Muslim countries namely Syria, Libya, Iran, Iraq, Sudan and obviously Palestine, being promoted by the media as supporters of violence.
10) Some of the statements made by Western leaders, especially those made by the US president and published in international media about the need to revamp education syllabus in the Al-Azhar University, in Egypt show a sense of prejudice against Islam.

11) Many of the western media display images of veiled or purdah-adorned Muslim women with terrorist issues although those pictures originally are devoid of any terrorist connection (Byng, 2010).

12) The publications of some cartoons that humiliate Islam and prophet Muhammad pbuh as well as the misinterpretation of some verses from the Koran by Gilders published in some of the media have directly linked Islam with terrorism (Miera & Pala, 2009).

**Framing Muslims after 9/11**

Talking about framing issues related to Islam and Muslims especially after 9/11, there have been tremendous discussions made by media scholars. How are Muslims being framed in the media after 9/11? Orbe and Harris (2008) found that after the attacks on WTC, terrorists has been identified as Muslim fundamentalists or ‘Islamists’ which has increased some prejudices, discriminations against and attacks on Muslims or those from the Middle East. Kumar (2008) studied on existing literatures on Orientalism old and new ways in which Muslims, particularly Arabs have been negatively framed post 9/11, he identified a number of discursive frames that have been employed in representing Muslims, Arabs and the those from the Middle East in aftermath of September 11;

1) Islam is a monolithic religion

2) Islam is a uniquely sexist religion
3) The “Muslim mind” is incapable of rationality and science

4) Islam is inherently violent

5) The West spreads democracy, Islam spawns terrorism

Following all the above literatures on framings, Malcolm et.al (2010) discussed on the bad representations of Islam and Muslims post 9/11 by the western media through the news coverage on the death of the Pakistan cricket team’s coach. They cited on the cultural differences of the East and the West proposed by the western journalists in their media in which the negative frames were addressed directly towards Islamic and Muslim cultures such as “irrational” Muslim culture, “violent” Muslim cricket fans and ‘unchanging”, “pre-modern” Muslim behavior, while the Western culture is depicted as “rational”, “human” and “cosmopolitan”.

Unlike all the above literatures, Noor Mayudia and her colleagues (2010) who analyzed on news frames in Malaysian English newspapers have identified 5 negative frames on Islam and Muslims which were found in *The Star* and yet there were 2 positive news frames in the *News Straits Times* newspapers. The frames are:

1) Islam is inherently Violent

2) Islam does not go well with the concept of peace

3) Islamic country’s political chaos is an on-going problem

4) Islamic country’s technological advances are means of destructions

5) US’s assault on Islamic Countries is for their (Islamic countries) own good

6) Terrorism and wars are common in the Islamic countries, yet Islam is not to be blamed

7) The Muslim countries are slowly moving from extremism to peace and moderation.
Similarly, Dina Ibrahim (2010) argued that the western media have made some kinds of selection in framing Islam and Muslims. According to her, the Muslims and their religion, Islam, are divided into two categories—the internal and the external. Islam that is practiced by American Muslims within the US region is considered as internal and has been positively framed by the media post 9/11 while the external—other than those categorized as ‘the internal’—are the ones that always receive negative frames in any news coverage. While according to Mishra (2008), despite the fact that Islam is being portrayed as a threat to democracy, the US media believe in the need to secularize and modernize Islam according to Western standards as to render it compatible to democracy.

The framings on Islam and Muslims post 9/11 in western media are further discussed in a number of media research and the issues go around various aspects concerning Islam and Muslims. For example, Bnyg (2010) argued that American Muslim women’s veiling issue is portrayed by the US media as againsts the national identity and a common sense that is created by these media is that western Muslim women should not put on the veil in public. Finally, it is undeniably that the power of framings is very strong in influencing people’s perception and in the case of Muslim framings post 9/11, where Muslims themselves who have the exposure on western news coverage like CNN tend to believe the accusations that have been made against Muslim Arabs for the terrorist act that occurred on September 11 (Entman, 2008).

Research Method
This research is based on the analysis of news magazines articles content about the framing made on Islam and terrorism. A four-month (representing four different periods of time) of news articles from TIME and The Economist have been analyzed. The collection of the data was divided into four different periods;

1) One month right before the September 11
2) One month right after the September 11
3) One month 5 years after the September 11
4) One month 10 years after the September 11

These news magazines were selected for a number of reasons; first the United States is a major superpower and an important player in the role of framing Islam and labeling it with terrorism, particularly after the September 11 attacks. The US also represent the supremacy of the western world in terms of social, political and military and their media have been used as reference by other countries. United Kingdom is selected due to its status as economic power and holding strong political position particularly in the European region. With its long historical relationship with Islam and Muslim countries especially in the Middle East throughout 18th and 19th century, its media would have a unique dimension on the representation of Islam. All these news magazines are considered elite magazines in each own country and are among the largest media outlets in terms of circulation. They are the leading newspapers with regard to the coverage of international news and views, drawing readers from around the world.

The choice of printed version over the online version is made due to the fact that they can be analyzed in terms of their pages, size of articles, size of photos, and the font which will give a
significant impact on the framing. Although online version seems more global, printed magazine is still a conventional and preferred way for media organizations to publish their product. It is more mass in its distribution and reaches all levels of society, regardless whether the readers have access to technology or not. This research also stresses on how these media expose the labeling, whether through words, phrases, sentences or even images available in creating labels on Islam and terrorism. Evaluation on sample news articles will take into consideration the articles and visuals. Any images that are shown will also be measured due to their significance and special meanings to the data and research.

It is believed that, the September 11 attack has been a major starting point for the media to label Islam with terrorism and many incidents after that represent the high degree of psychological attacks on Muslims worldwide by these media due to a number of incidents which can link Islam with terrorism occurring around the world, especially after September 11 which reflects Islam directly.

163 articles that focused on Islam or Muslim which cover topics such as politics, social, technology, crime, war, family, culture, law, policy and others have been identified. These topics were chosen to cover all aspects of Islam as a way of life. A coding instrument comprises of 3 sections was used to asses content of related news article. The first section of the instrument recorded general information of the article such as headlines, size of article and visual featured. The second section analyzed the content of the article in terms of the subject matter, theme and type of significant word used to portray Islam or Muslim. In the third section, the researchers have coded information related to overall framing of the article including the tone and the type of
framing. The tone of the article basically relied on types of words used. The tone is considered positive when there were words like “development”, “anti-terrorism”, “freedom” used, while the tone is negative when words like “terrorist”, “militant”, “bombing”, “fundamentalist” are used and the tone is considered as neutral when the article does not really reflect whether it is condemning or praising Islam/Muslims (Pollock et al, 2005). Finally, the researchers studied on the overall framing of the news article whether Islam or Muslim in that particular news article has been associated with terrorism or not.

The Findings

The following tables and figures are based on the analysis done on 163 articles both from TIME and The Economist. These articles were selected on the basis of either they made a direct or indirect coverage on Islam or Muslims.

1) Total Number of News Articles

In identifying the coverage of these news magazines in framing Islam and Muslims, the researchers have analyzed few related and significant items in the data. The first one is in terms of the total number of news articles from each news magazine. Table 1 shows that from the total number of all news articles gathered, The Economist covered 22.8 percents more news on Islam/Muslims than TIME in which TIME produced less than 40 percents articles on Islam/Muslims of the whole articles collected for all selected periods. The frequency of coverage is very obvious as 61.4 percents or 100 news articles collected were from The Economist while only 38.6 percents or 63 articles contributed by TIME.
Table 1: Total Number of News Articles on Islam/Muslims in TIME and The Economist

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>News magazines</th>
<th>n</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>TIME</td>
<td>63</td>
<td>38.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Economist</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>61.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>163</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

N=163

2) Total Number of News Articles Based on Periods

Table 2 on the other hand displays the distribution of articles from each news magazine following every single period selected. Apparently in every period, The Economist covered more news related to Islam or Muslims than TIME. The coverage on Islam and Muslims was rather high for both media in the second period as it refers to immediate post 9/11 incident with TIME contributing 57 percent of the total of 63 articles from TIME and 22 percent of all articles collected from both news magazines. While the number of articles from The Economist during this period was the highest, that is 40 percent of its own total or 25.5 percent of both news magazines.

Among the four periods, TIME’s coverage on Islam and Muslims during the first period is the least which was only six articles of the total 63 while the least number of news articles on Islam or Muslims covered by The Economist can be identified in the final period as the researchers found only 15 related articles during this period from 100 articles gathered from The Economist.

Table 2: Distribution of News Articles Following the Selection of Periods

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Period</th>
<th>TIME ( n )</th>
<th>%</th>
<th>The Economist ( n )</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

16
3) Size of News Articles

Size of articles is important to determine the impact of the news. Normally, the bigger the article the higher the attention from the readers will be and the more significant it will be. For this matter, the researchers have analyzed the size of news articles collected and qualitative characteristics have been given to label the data that were initially measured based on Class Interval Formula. Qualitative characteristics is one of the methods applied for grouped data and has been used as an alternative to numerical intervals (Newbold et al, 2009). Based on this, a total of 5 labels have been used by the researcher to label the size of the articles. They are; ‘less than 1/2 page’ (between 49.5 cm² - 120 cm²), ‘1/2 page’ (between 121 cm² - 162 cm²), ‘3/4 page’ (between 163 cm² - 247 cm²), ‘one page’ (between 248 cm² - 355 cm²) and ‘more than one page (356 cm² and above). Table 3 shows the frequency of the news articles according to different class of sizes. From 163 articles on Islam/Muslims in both news magazines, 53 articles were written in more than one page. This shows that about 32.5 % of related news articles gave a high impact to the readers and the issues touched in these articles were considered as significant and important.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Period</th>
<th>First period</th>
<th>Second period</th>
<th>Third period</th>
<th>Fourth period</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>6</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>10</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>17</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL</td>
<td>63</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

N=163
To compare between TIME and The Economist, the researchers have provided the details as in Table 4. Based on the table, there is a significant difference in terms of size of articles between these two magazines (Chi-square=24.954, d.f=4, p=0.000). For all periods selected, TIME has not covered a single article on Islam/Muslims which is less than half page size while for The Economist, though the tendency was not significant enough, it still has about 10 articles (10%) of a half page size.

Most of the pages where articles on Islam/Muslims covered in TIME consisted of more than one page that is 42.9% or 27 out of the total 63 articles. However, The Economist seemed to have a tendency of producing articles on Islam/Muslims that which are either half of a page or more than one page. 26 articles (26%) out of 100 articles in The Economist were half page size and another 26 (26%) were more than one page size. It can be concluded that articles which have a bigger page size were given more attention by the readers thus making them (articles on Islam/Muslims) among very significant articles as these news magazines always provide bigger pages for related news.
Table 4: The differences in size of news article between TIME and The Economist

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Size of news article</th>
<th>TIME (frequency)</th>
<th>%</th>
<th>The Economist (frequency)</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Less than half page</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>½ page</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>6.3</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>¾ page</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>14.3</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>One page</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>36.5</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>More than one page</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>42.9</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTAL</strong></td>
<td><strong>63</strong></td>
<td><strong>100</strong></td>
<td><strong>63</strong></td>
<td><strong>100</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

N=163, $X^2=24.954$, d.f=4, p=0.000

The researchers also conducted an analysis on the difference in size of articles between periods. Table 5 below displays the result in which the differences are quite significant ($\chi^2=21.335$, df=12, p=0.046). In the first period, that is before Sep 11 incident, the biggest frequency within this period is 10 one-page sized articles or 43.48% of the total 23 articles and about 8 articles or 34.78% were more than one page size. However, only 3 articles or 13.04% and 2 or 8.7% were half of a page and a three quarter page size respectively and none of the articles coded during this period consisted of size that was less than half of a page.

In the second period or right after the September 11 attack, it is very obvious from the table that the highest frequency of articles were more than one page size. Out of 76 articles, 24 (31.58%) were sized more than one page and 18 or 23.68% articles were within one page size. There were altogether 34 articles which were less than one page in size with percentages of 18.42% (14 articles) for three quarter page size, 19.73% (15 articles) for half of a page size and only 6.5% (5 articles) for less than half page size.
The third period or 5 years after 9/11 showed a little difference in which there was similar number of articles at two different sizes. From the total of 38 articles, only 1 article coded for each mentioned size that brings to the percentage of 2.7% each and the majority of articles coded during this period was still at the size of more than one page (14 articles or 36.84%) and articles with one page size were 13 or 34.21% while only 9 articles (23.68%) were measured having a size within half of a page.

Articles that belong to the last period or after 10 years of 9/11 were also demonstrated as significantly different from the other three periods. With a total of 26 articles coded, 27% or 7 articles were measured at a size of three quarter page and the other 7 for more than one page size and this is the highest frequency among the sizes measured. The second highest is articles that are sized within one page that is 5 or 19.2% articles while only 3 (12%) and 4 (15%) articles were measured at half of a page and less than one page respectively.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>before 9/11</th>
<th>right after 9/11</th>
<th>5 years after 9/11</th>
<th>10 years after 9/11</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>size of news article</td>
<td>less than 1/2 page</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1/2 page</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3/4 page</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Briefly, it can be implied from this analysis that articles on Islam/Muslims always receive great attention by the international media as most of them measured between one to more than one page. This is due to the fact that large sized articles are always perceived by readers as important and significant.

4) Visual articles

Noor Mayudia et al. (2010) argued that visuals explain better than words and at the same time plays an important role in convincing the readers about particular issues. Based on this argument and in achieving the objective to identify the coverage on Islam and Muslims made by TIME and The Economist, the researchers have studied frequency of articles that have visual effects. As depicted in Table 6, from 163 articles selected, 143 (87.7%) articles have pictures displayed along with the story posted in the articles while only 20 articles or 12.3% without visuals. This shows that most articles on Islam/Muslim in international media like TIME and The Economist portray visuals as supportive element which makes every story more meaningful.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percent</th>
<th>Cumulative Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Articles with picture</td>
<td>143</td>
<td>87.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Articles without picture</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>12.3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The researchers also made an analysis on the size of pictures in selected articles. This is important as to see whether visual articles are important for media practitioners and usually having large photos give good impact to readers. After using class interval formula, the researchers have qualitatively categorized the sizes of every photo into specific rank of order; small, medium, and large pictures. Small pictures were classed for those between 4 cm² - 175 cm². The second category was selected from pictures sized between 176 cm² - 347 cm² while for pictures that measured between 348 cm² - 519 cm² were given a ‘large’ category. Table 7 below visualizes these categories.

From 143 articles that came with photos, majority of them depicted photos that were at medium size (61 = 42.5%) while 56 (39.0%) articles had photos measured as small and only 27 articles or 18.5% supported their stories with large photos. This can be concluded that most articles on Islam/Muslims published in international media are considered as important and at some point, sensational, as a large number of them have visuals attached as to prove their importance. Printing these photos mostly at medium size showed that the articles were considered remarkable. Most probably TIME and The Economist used these photos to draw greater attention from readers.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percent</th>
<th>Valid Percent</th>
<th>Cumulative Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>small</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>39.0</td>
<td>39.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
5) Themes of News Articles

For this study, the researchers have used themes which were explored by a previous researcher in a research of similar background (Hashim, 2009). There are 11 major themes:

- Islam as a cause of terrorism
- Islam leads to conflict
- Muslim leaders
- Muslim main profiles
- Muslim countries
- Islamic movements
- Muslim hero
- Islamic fundamentalism
- Islamic practices
- Weapon/Nuclear development
- Crisis in Muslim countries

For any of the themes that could not be categorized in any of the above selected themes, the researchers placed them under the category of ‘others’. The distribution of articles following each theme can be observed in Table 9. Generally, articles that touched on Muslim countries were the highest in frequency having 31 or 19.0% articles that are based on Muslim countries as the main theme. The theme ‘Islam as a cause of terrorism’ could be found in 24 articles (14.7%)
while 14 or 8.6% articles focused on ‘crisis in Muslim countries’. About 11 and 10 articles (6.7% and 6.1%) were identified to touch on Islamic movement and Muslim main profiles respectively. 14 articles shared the same percentage, that is, 4.3% each with coverage on Islamic practices and Muslim leaders while articles with themes ‘Islam leads to conflict’, ‘weapon/nuclear development’ and ‘Islamic fundamentalism’ were 8 (4.9%), 6 (3.7%) and 5 (3.1%) respectively. The ‘Muslim hero’ is the least used. The researcher found this theme in only one article (0.6%). The ‘others’ category was actually a combination of various themes such as economics, business and finance which were not really significant in issues related to Islam and terrorism.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Theme</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percent</th>
<th>Valid Percent</th>
<th>Cumulative Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Islam as a cause of terrorism</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>14.7</td>
<td>14.7</td>
<td>14.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Islam leads to conflict</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>4.9</td>
<td>4.9</td>
<td>19.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Muslim leaders</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>4.3</td>
<td>4.3</td>
<td>23.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Muslim main profiles</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>6.1</td>
<td>6.1</td>
<td>30.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Muslim countries</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>19.0</td>
<td>19.0</td>
<td>49.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Islamic movements</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>6.7</td>
<td>6.7</td>
<td>55.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Muslim hero</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>.6</td>
<td>.6</td>
<td>56.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Islamic fundamentalism</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3.1</td>
<td>3.1</td>
<td>59.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Islamic practices</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>4.3</td>
<td>4.3</td>
<td>63.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>weapon/nuclear development</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>3.7</td>
<td>3.7</td>
<td>67.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>crisis in Muslim countries</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>8.6</td>
<td>8.6</td>
<td>76.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>others</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>23.9</td>
<td>23.9</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>163</strong></td>
<td><strong>100.0</strong></td>
<td><strong>100.0</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

N=163

6) Portrayal of News Articles
The researchers also analyzed portrayal of news articles. The articles were categorized according to two different portrayals; articles that portrayed Islam/Muslims as the main subject and articles that did not portray Islam/Muslims as the main subject. Based on Table 10, from 163 articles selected, 111 articles or 68.1% have depicted Islam/Muslims as the main subjects in the articles while only 52 or 31.9 articles portrayed Islam/Muslims as not the main subject. This vast contrast between the two portrayals revealed that large number of articles which are related to Islam/Muslims published in international media like the one in TIME and The Economist are undeniably of great attention as they portray Islam/Muslims as the main subject.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percent</th>
<th>Cumulative Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>islam/muslims as the main subject</td>
<td>111</td>
<td>68.1</td>
<td>68.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>islam/muslims not as the main subject</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>31.9</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>163</strong></td>
<td><strong>100.0</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

7) **The tone of the article**

The news articles were divided into three tones as this is to help detect framing better (Noor Mayudia et al, 2010). The tones were identified whether the articles were having a positive, negative or neutral tone towards Islam/Muslims. Word association has been used to identify the tones of the news articles. From 163 articles as displayed in Table 11, 92 articles or 56.4% had
negative tone towards Islam/Muslims while only 8 articles (4.9%) used positive tone. The rest 63 articles or 38.7% developed a neutral tone.

Table 11: The Tone of Articles

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percent</th>
<th>Cumulative percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Positive</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>4.9</td>
<td>4.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Negative</td>
<td>92</td>
<td>56.4</td>
<td>61.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>63</td>
<td>38.7</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>163</strong></td>
<td><strong>100.0</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

When the researchers made a comparison of the tone between the four periods, it has been discovered that the articles posted during the second period that is right after the September 11 attack had the highest in portraying Islam/Muslims negatively. This may be due to the fact that 9/11 incident has very much changed the life of Muslims worldwide as they had become the target for the cause of such tragic incident. The chart below (Figure 1) proves this finding.

Figure 1: Comparison of the Tone of Articles between Periods
The final examination was on identification of the overall framing, as to whether the article associated Islam/Muslim with terrorism. This analysis very much depends on types of words used by the article in portraying Islam/Muslims. When the researchers identified negative words used in representing Islam/Muslims, the researchers further examined whether these words showed direct association of Islam/Muslims with terrorism. Words such as “zealots”, “terrorists”, “extremist” “suicide bombers”, “militant”, violent” and few others were the key words for this identification.

In Table 12, more than half (53.4%) of all the news articles from both news magazines framed Islam/Muslims as associated with terrorism. This percentage, when compared with Table 13, becomes highly remarkable because it shows that from 92 articles with negative tone, 87 or
94.6% of them have framed Islam/Muslims as being associated with terrorism. It means only 5 articles with negative tone did not associate Islam/Muslims with terrorism.

Table 12: Overall Framing of The Articles

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percent</th>
<th>Cumulative Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Islam/Muslims associated with terrorism</td>
<td>87</td>
<td>53.4</td>
<td>53.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Islam/Muslims not associated with terrorism</td>
<td>76</td>
<td>46.6</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Total 163

Table 13: The Overall Framing within Negative Tone Category

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percent</th>
<th>Cumulative Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Islam/Muslims associated with terrorism</td>
<td>87</td>
<td>94.6</td>
<td>94.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Islam/Muslims not associated with terrorism</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5.4</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Total 92

Discussions and Conclusion

Generally, this research has proven that international media tend to associate Islam and Muslims with terrorism regardless of significant incidents that relate to terrorist attacks such as September 11. However, the association was remarkably high following such incidents. Media from the United Kingdom like The Economist has shown higher tendency in producing news articles related to Islam or Muslims as compared to the ones from the United States.
It is believed that coverage on Islam/Muslims in international media is always becoming one of the major attentions both by the media practitioners as well as readers. The size of pictures or illustrations and size of articles which are mostly big, as found in this research prove the statements. Regardless of period, both TIME and The Economist were found to have such tendency in presenting articles pertaining to Islam and Muslims in big volumes. However, the tendency became significantly high post 9/11 incident.

Theme is one of the major elements in producing news and both news magazines analyzed in this research have portrayed similar themes in framing Islam and Muslims with terrorism. The researchers have found that most news articles that frame Islam negatively portray similar themes and these themes have also been depicted by other prominent western media (Hashim, 2009). It can be concluded that both media produce a frequent momentum of certain themes where these themes were repeatedly used by both media following certain crucial events like the September 11 attack.

In terms of the tone, there were more articles with negative tone than other tones for both TIME and The Economist at all selected periods. This implies that international media are prone to portray articles related to Islam or Muslims with negative tone compared to positive or neutral tones. For the overall framing, this research showed that the association of Islam/Muslims with terrorism was remarkably high during the 9/11 incident and gradually decreased after 10 years of the attack. The death of Osama bin Laden and the tolerable policy implemented by Barrack Obama for Islam as a religion and Muslims worldwide are believed to have somehow influenced such patterns of framing in both selected media.
The Conclusion

This study concludes that when it comes to Islam or Muslims, the International media especially from the US and UK are likely to make news coverage on issues such as politics, terrorism/violence and conflict. Very rarely news stories can be found on other topics such as education or economy. The portrayal is more towards negative than positive and it is remarkably high when tragic incidents occurred and Muslims are targeted for the blame. This can be seen right after the September 11 attack in 2001 and the London bombing in 2005. The negative framings were obviously high and opposite framings were almost unavailable. However, during periods where no tragic incidents were reported, the coverage turned to be slightly more on positive stories.

Therefore, the framing of Islam with terrorism can still be extracted from major international media, especially those from the West. It is something that needs to be taken into serious consideration as biasness against Islam will only jeopardize the peace efforts between West and East. Mahathir Mohamad (2003) insisted that the universal definition of terrorism ought to be reformulated and warmly accepted by all. He argued that terrorism should not be associated with any religion, race or creed as always portrayed especially by western media. Linking Islam to terrorism is definitely unfair because it is not exclusively related to any particular religion. Religious classification may result in a complete charge against Islam which will negatively affect the whole innocent Muslims and this will lead to unwarranted prejudice and hatred.
References


